

Attack on Fully Homomorphic Encryption over the Integers

Gu Chunsheng

School of Computer Engineering

Jiangsu Teachers University of Technology

Changzhou, China, 213001

guchunsheng@gmail.com

Abstract: This paper presents a heuristic attack on the fully homomorphic encryption over the integers by using lattice reduction algorithm. Our result shows that the FHE in [DGHV10] is not secure for some parameter settings. We also present an improvement scheme to avoid the lattice attack in this paper.

Keywords: Fully Homomorphic Encryption, Cryptanalysis, Lattice Reduction

1. Introduction

Rivest, Adleman and Dertouzos [RAD78] introduced a notion of privacy homomorphism. But until 2009, Gentry [Gen09] constructed the first fully homomorphic encryptions based on ideal lattice, all previous schemes are insecure. Following the breakthrough of [Gen09], there is currently great interest on fully-homomorphic encryption [SV10, vDGHV10, SS10, GH11a, GH11b, BV11a, BV11b, BGV11, CJMNT11, CMNT11]. In these schemes, the simplest one is certainly the one of van Dijk, Gentry, Halevi and Vaikuntanathan [DGHV10]. The public key of this scheme is a list of approximate multiples $\{x_i = q_i p + 2r_i\}_{i=1}^{\tau}$ for an odd integer

p , where q_i, r_i is the uniform random integers over \mathbb{Z} such that $|r_i| < 2^{\lambda-1}$. The secret key is p . To encrypt a message bit m , the ciphertext is evaluated as $c = \sum_{i \in T, T \subseteq [\tau]} x_i + 2r + m$, where $|r| < 2^{\lambda-1}$. To decrypt a ciphertext, compute the message bit $m = [c]_p \bmod 2$, where $[c]_p$ is an integer in $(-p/2, p/2)$.

To conveniently compare, we simply describe the known attacks considering in the Section 5 and appendix B in [DGHV10]. Section 5 in [DGHV10] considered known attacks on the AGCD problem for two numbers (x_0, x_1) and many numbers (x_0, \dots, x_t) . These attacks mainly discussed how to solve approximate GCD problem, i.e. the secret key p . The appendix B.1 in [DGHV10] analyzed Nguyen and Stern's orthogonal lattice attack. Given

$\vec{x} = (x_0, \dots, x_t) = p\vec{q} + \vec{r}$, where $\vec{q} = (q_0, \dots, q_t)$ and $\vec{r} = (r_0, \dots, r_t)$, consider the t -dimensional lattice $L_{\vec{x}}^\perp$ of integer vectors orthogonal to \vec{x} . It is easy to verify that any vector that is orthogonal to both \vec{q} and \vec{r} , that is, is in the lattice $L_{\vec{q}, \vec{r}}^\perp$, it is also in $L_{\vec{x}}^\perp$. According to [DGHV10], the idea of the attack is to reduce $L_{\vec{x}}^\perp$ to recover $t-1$ linearly independent vectors of $L_{\vec{q}, \vec{r}}^\perp$, and further recover \vec{q} and \vec{r} , and p . Then Dijk et al. discussed that when $t > \gamma / (\eta - \rho)$, lattice reduction algorithms can not find a $2^{\eta - \rho}$ approximate short vectors in $L_{\vec{q}, \vec{r}}^\perp$ on the worst-case.

Dijk et al. also analyzed a similar above attack by using the constraint $x_i - r_i \equiv 0 \pmod{p}$, which also paid close attention to how to solve for the \vec{r} . They considered a lattice as follows.

$$M = \begin{pmatrix} x_1 & R_1 & & \\ x_2 & & R_2 & \\ & & \ddots & \\ x_t & & & R_t \end{pmatrix}.$$

But one needs to find t linearly independent short vectors of the lattice M to obtain the success of this attack. That is, each l_1 norm among t vectors is at most $p/2$. When t is large, solving these vectors is very difficult by using lattice reduction algorithm.

In addition, instead of applying linear system $x_i - r_i \equiv 0 \pmod{p}$, Coppersmith's method looks at quadratic system $(x_i - r_i)^2 \equiv 0 \pmod{p^2}$ and $(x_i - r_i)(x_j - r_j) \equiv 0 \pmod{p^2}$, etc, and finds one of the r_i and thereof p and all other r_i 's by solving some small vectors in new lattice.

In a word, the attacks considering in the Section 5 and appendix B in [DGHV10] is how to recover the secret key p , and their security analysis depends on the worst-case performance of the currently known lattice reduction algorithms.

The lattice we constructed is very similar to the lattice M . However, our attack only requires find one short vectors with certain condition, and not to solve t short vectors. Moreover, our attack merely recovers the plaintext from a ciphertext and depends upon the average-case performance of the lattice reduction algorithms. On the other hand, if suppose $\vec{x} = (c, x_0, \dots, x_t) = p\vec{q} + 2\vec{r} + m$ with a ciphertext c , then our attack in some sense is similar to solving a short vector of orthogonal lattice $L_{\vec{q}}^\perp$, which is different from the lattices

L_x^\perp or $L_{\bar{q}, \bar{r}}^\perp$ considering in the Section 5 and appendix B in [DGHV10].

Our Contribution. Our main observation is that one can directly obtain the plaintext from a ciphertext and the public key without using the secret key for some parameter settings of the FHE in [DGHV10]. The attack in this paper is different from the known attacks considering in [DGHV10]. Because our method is how to recover the plaintext from a ciphertext, whereas the attacks they considered is how to solve the secret key in the scheme. So, our result shows that the FHE in [DGHV10] is not secure for some practical parameters.

Organization of This Paper. Section 2 gives some notations and definitions, and the lattice reduction algorithms. Section 3 constructs a new lattice based on the public key, and presents a polynomial time algorithm to directly obtain plaintext from ciphertext. Section 4 presents an improvement scheme. Section 5 concludes this paper.

2. Preliminaries

2.1 Notations

In this paper, we follow the parameter setting of [DGHV10]. Let λ be a security parameter, $[\lambda] = \{1, \dots, \lambda\}$ be a set of integers. Let γ be bit-length of the integers in the public key, η the bit-length of the secret key, ρ the bit-length of the noise, and τ the number of integers in the public key. To conveniently describe, we concretely set $\rho = \lambda$, $\eta = 4\lambda^2$, $\gamma = \lambda^5$, and $\tau = \gamma + \lambda$ throughout this paper.

Let $w \leftarrow \Psi - S$ denote to choose an element w in S according to the distribution Ψ .

2.2 Lattices

A lattice in \mathbb{R}^m is the set of all integral combination of n linearly independent vectors b_1, \dots, b_n in \mathbb{R}^m ($m \geq n$), namely $L = L(b_1, \dots, b_n) = \{\sum_{i=1}^n x_i b_i, x_i \in \mathbb{Z}\}$, usually denoted as a matrix B . Any such n -tuple of vectors b_1, \dots, b_n is called a basis of the lattice L . Every lattice has an infinite number of lattice bases. Two lattice bases $B_1, B_2 \in \mathbb{R}^{n \times m}$ are equivalent if and only if $B_1 = UB_2$ for some unimodular matrix $U \in \mathbb{Z}^{n \times n}$. The volume of a lattice L is the determinant of any basis of L , namely $\text{vol}(L) = \det(L) = \sqrt{B^T B}$.

2.3 Lattice Reduction Algorithm

Given a basis of the lattice b_1, \dots, b_n , one of the most famous problems of the algorithm theory of lattices is to find a short nonzero vector. Currently, there is no polynomial time algorithm for solving a shortest nonzero vector in a given lattice. The most celebrated LLL reduction finds a vector whose approximating factor is at most $2^{(n-1)/2}$. In 1987, Schnorr [Sch87] introduced a hierarchy of reduction concepts that stretch from LLL reduction to Korkine-Zolotareff reduction which obtains a polynomial time algorithm with $(4k^2)^{n/2k}$ approximating factor for lattices of any rank. The running time of Schnorr's algorithm is $\text{poly}(\text{size of basis})^* \text{HKZ}(2k)$, where $\text{HKZ}(2k)$ is the time complexity of computing a $2k$ -dimensional HKZ reduction, and equal to $O(k^{k/2+o(k)})$. If we use the probabilistic AKS algorithm [AKS01], $\text{HKZ}(2k)$ is about $O(2^{2k})$.

Theorem 2.1 (Sch87 Theorem 2.6) Every block $2k$ -reduced basis b_1, \dots, b_{m_k} of lattice L satisfies $\|b_1\| \leq \sqrt{\gamma_k} \beta_k^{\frac{m-1}{2}} \lambda_1(L)$, where β_k is another lattice constant using in Schnorr's analysis of his algorithm.

Schnorr [Sch87] showed that $\beta_k \leq 4k^2$, and Ajtai improved this bound to $\beta_k \leq k^\varepsilon$ for some positive number $\varepsilon > 0$. Recently, Gama Howgrave, Koy and Nguyen [GHKN06] improved the approximation factor of the Schnorr's $2k$ -reduction to $\|b_1\| / \lambda_1(L) \leq \sqrt{\gamma_k} (4/3)^{(3k-1)/4} \beta_k^{n/2k-1}$, and proved the following result via Rankin's constant.

Theorem 2.2 (GHKN06 Theorem 2, 3) For all $k \geq 2$, Schnorr's constant β_k satisfies:

$k/12 \leq \beta_k \leq (1+k/2)^{2\ln 2 + 1/k}$. Asymptotically it satisfies $\beta_k \leq 0.1 \times k^{2\ln 2 + 1/k}$. In particular, $\beta_k \leq k^{1.1}$ for all $k \leq 100$.

Observation 2.3 (NS06). For lattice L , the first vector b_1 output by LLL is satisfied to the ratio $\|b_1\| / \lambda(L) \approx (1.02)^n$ on the average.

3. Attack on FHE Scheme

To describe simplicity, we first refer the FHE scheme in [DGHV10], then construct a new lattice based on the public key and recover the plaintext bit from a ciphertext by applying LLL lattice reduction algorithm.

3.1 Fully Homomorphic Encryption

KeyGen(λ). The secret key is a random odd η -bit integer: $p \leftarrow \mathbb{Z} \cap [2^{\eta-1}, 2^\eta]$.

Select $q_0, \dots, q_\tau \leftarrow \mathbb{Z} \cap [0, 2^\gamma / p]$ with the largest odd integer q_0 . Select $r_0, \dots, r_\tau \leftarrow \mathbb{Z} \cap [-2^\rho, 2^\rho]$, compute $x_0 = q_0 p + 2r_0$ and $x_i = [q_i p + 2r_i]_{x_0}$ for $i \in [\tau]$. Output the public key $pk = \langle x_0, x_1, \dots, x_\tau \rangle$ and the secret key $sk = \langle p \rangle$.

Encrypt($pk, m \in \{0, 1\}$). Select a random subset $T \subseteq [\tau]$ and $r \leftarrow \mathbb{Z} \cap [-2^\rho, 2^\rho]$, and output ciphertext $c = [m + 2r + \sum_{i \in T} x_i]_{x_0}$.

Decrypt(sk, c). Output $m' = [[c]_p]_2$.

To implement fully homomorphic encryption scheme, one applies to it the standard Gentry's bootstappable technique.

3.2 Lattice Attack Based on the Public Key

Given a list of approximate multiples of p :

$$\{x_i = q_i p + r_i : q_i \in \mathbb{Z} \cap [0, 2^\gamma / p], r_i \in \mathbb{Z} \cap (-2^\rho, 2^\rho)\}_{i=0}^\tau, \text{ find } p.$$

Dijk et al. [DGHV10] showed that the security of their FHE scheme is equivalent to solving the approximate GCD problem. Chen and Nguyen [CN11] presented a new AGCD algorithm running in $2^{3\rho/2}$ polynomial-time operations, which is essentially the $3/4$ -th root of that of GCD exhaustive search.

According to FHE, we know that an arbitrary ciphertext has general form $c = qp + 2r + m$.

The ideal of our attack is very simple, that is, one is how to remove qp in a ciphertext c by adding small noise value. When completing this, it is easy to recover the plaintext bit m in c . To do this, we, we define following Diophantine inequality equation problem.

Definition 3.1. (Diophantine Inequality Equation (DIE)). Given a list of integers $\{x_i = q_i p + r_i : q_i \in \mathbb{Z} \cap [0, 2^\gamma / p], r_i \in \mathbb{Z} \cap (-2^\rho, 2^\rho)\}_{i=0}^\tau$, solve the Diophantine inequality equation $\left| \sum_{i=0}^\tau y_i x_i \right| < p/8$ subject to $|y_i| < p/(8\tau 2^\rho)$ and at least one non-zero y_i .

Suppose there is an oracle to solve the above DIE problem, then one can obtain the plaintext bit in an arbitrary ciphertext of FHE [DGHV10]. Since $|y_i| < p/(8\tau 2^\rho)$, $\left| \sum_{i=0}^\tau y_i r_i \right| < p/8$,

that is, $\sum_{i=0}^\tau y_i x_i$ is only the sum of noise terms, without non-zero multiple of p . So, one

can correctly decide the plaintext bit of a ciphertext in FHE according to the parity of $\sum_{i=0}^{\tau} y_i x_i$.

However, it is not difficult to see that the Diophantine inequality equation is a generalization of the knapsack problem. So, there is unlikely an efficient algorithm for general DIE unless P=NP. But, this does not demonstrate that there is not a polynomial time algorithm for special DIE.

To be concrete, we construct a new lattice based on the public key of the FHE [DGHV10].

Given the public key $pk = \langle x_0, x_1, \dots, x_\tau \rangle$ and ciphertext c , we randomly choose a subset

T from $[\tau]$ such that $|T| = \lambda^3$. Without generality of loss, assume $T = [\lambda^3]$ and $c = qp + 2r + m$ with $|2r| \leq 2^\rho$. We construct a new lattice as follows:

$$L = \begin{pmatrix} c & 0 & \cdots & 0 & 0 \\ -x_1 & 1 & \cdots & 0 & 0 \\ \vdots & \vdots & \cdots & \vdots & \vdots \\ -x_{\lambda^3} & 0 & \cdots & 1 & 0 \\ -x_0 & 0 & \cdots & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix}, L_1 = \begin{pmatrix} c & 1 & 0 & \cdots & 0 & 0 \\ -x_1 & 0 & 1 & \cdots & 0 & 0 \\ \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \cdots & \vdots & \vdots \\ -x_{\lambda^3} & 0 & 0 & \cdots & 1 & 0 \\ -x_0 & 0 & 0 & \cdots & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix}.$$

On the one hand, the size of the shortest vector of lattice L is less than $\sqrt{\lambda^3 + 2} |c|^{1/(\lambda^3+2)} \approx 2^{\lambda^2}$ according to the parameter setting. On the other hand, there is a non-zero solution $\left| \sum_{i=0}^{\lambda^3} y_i x_i + yc \right| \leq 2^{\lambda^2}$ with $|y_i| \leq 2^{\lambda^2}$ and $|y| \leq 2^{\lambda^2}$ by using pigeon hole principle. This is because $|c|, |x_i| \leq 2^{\lambda^5}$, the number of all distinct y_i, y subject to

$|y|, |y_i| \leq 2^{\lambda^2}$ is $(2^{\lambda^2})^{\lambda^3+2} > 2^{\lambda^5}$, that is, there is at least a non-zero solution for the equation $\left| \sum_{i=0}^{\lambda^3} y_i x_i + yc \right| \leq 2^{\lambda^2}$. Thus, if one finds a non-zero small solution vector, then one gets the plaintext bit with probability at least 1/2 (y is an odd integer).

To conveniently decide, we use a variant lattice L_1 of L , and call LLL algorithm for lattice L_1 . Assume $b = (b_0, b_1, \dots, b_{\lambda^3+1})$ is the first vector of the L_1 's basis output by LLL. If $\|b\|_\infty < p / (8\lambda^3 2^\lambda)$ and $\text{mod}(b_1, 2) = 1$, then $m = \text{mod}(b_0, 2)$. In our experiment, we notice that b_1 may be an even integer, but the several vectors following the first vector (such as the second vector, or the third vector, et al.) often satisfy the above condition. That is, the first coordinate of vector is odd and its norm is small. So, as long as one gets one solution of the above form, one can correctly decide plaintext bit. In fact, LLL can also be called many times for distinct subset T .

So, we have the following result by applying the block lattice reduction.

Theorem 3.1. Suppose the parameters of FHE [DGHV10] $\lambda \leq 100$, $\rho = \lambda$, $\eta = 5\lambda^2$,

$\gamma = \lambda^5$, and $\tau = \gamma + \lambda$, then there is a running time $2^{\theta k}$, ($\theta \leq 1$) algorithm recovering plaintext from ciphertext.

Proof: According to Theorem 2.1, 2.2, we know $\|b_1\|/\lambda_1(L) \leq \sqrt{\gamma_k} (4/3)^{(3k-1)/4} \beta_k^{n/2k-1}$ and

$\beta_k \leq k^{1.1}$ for all $k \leq 100$. If we choose $k = \lambda, n = \lambda^3$, then we get

$\|b_1\| \approx \lambda^{1.1 \times \lambda^3/2\lambda} \times \lambda_1(L) \approx 2^{3.66\lambda^2} \lambda_1(L) \leq 2^{4.66\lambda^2} \ll 2^\eta$. By using AKS [AKS01, MV10]

algorithm, solving each block sub-lattice costs time $2^{\delta k}$, $\delta < 1$, and the times solving block is

at most $\lambda^{O(1)}$. So, the total running time of algorithm is $2^{\theta k}, \theta \leq 1$. ■

Theorem 3.2 Suppose the average-case performance of LLL is true, that is, Observation 2.3 holds. Then, for the parameters $\lambda \leq 100$, $\rho = \lambda$, $\eta = 4\lambda^2$, $\gamma = \lambda^5$, and $\tau = \gamma + \lambda$, the FHE scheme in [DGHV10] is insecure.

Proof: For the above lattice L_1 , we have

$$\|b\| \leq (1.02)^{\lambda^3+2} \lambda(L_1) \leq (1.02)^{100\lambda^2+2} \lambda(L_1) \approx 7.2^{\lambda^2} \lambda(L_1) \ll 2^{4\lambda^2}. ■$$

3.3 Computational Experiment

In the appendix, we present a toy example to show that our attack method is how to work.

4. Improvement

The reason the above lattice attack is successful is that the secret key p is a large integer. If we replace p by a matrix, then the above attack dose not work.

4.1 Construction

Key Generating Algorithm (KeyGen):

(1) Select a random matrix $T \in \mathbb{Z}^{2 \times 2}$ with $\|T\|_\infty = 2^{O(\lambda^2)}$ such that $p = \det(T) = 2^{O(\lambda^2)}$

and $p \bmod 2 = 1$. Compute $A \in \mathbb{Z}^{2 \times 2}$ with $AT = pI$, where I is identity matrix.

(2) Generate $\tau = O(\lambda \log \lambda)$ matrices $\{B_i = (R_i A + 2r_i \cdot I) \bmod p\}_{i=1}^\tau$, where $R_i \in \mathbb{Z}_p^{2 \times 2}$

is an uniformly random matrix and $|r_i| \leq 2^\lambda$ and r_i is integer.

(3) Output the public key $pk = (p, B_i, i \in [\tau])$ and the secret key $sk = (p, T)$.

Encryption Algorithm (Enc). Given the public key pk and a bit $m \in \{0,1\}$. Evaluate ciphertext $C = (\sum_{i \in [\tau]} k_i B_i + (m + 2r)I) \bmod p$ where $|k_i| \leq 2^\lambda$ and r is integer.

Add Operation (Add). Given the public key pk and ciphertexts C_1, C_2 , output new ciphertext $C = (C_1 + C_2) \bmod p$.

Multiplication Operation (Mul). Given the public key pk and ciphertexts C_1, C_2 , output new ciphertext $C = (C_1 \times C_2) \bmod p$.

Decryption Algorithm (Dec). Given the secret key sk and ciphertext C , decipher $M = (C \times T) \bmod p \bmod 2$, and the plaintext m is the element $m = M_{1,1}$ of the first row and the first column of M .

It is not difficult to verify that the above scheme is a somewhat homomorphic encryption. Now, one can use Gentry's standard bootstrappable technique to implement fully homomorphic encryption.

In addition, we can choose two random primes $p, q = 2^{O(\lambda^2)}$ with $p = a^2 + b^2$ i.e.

$$p \equiv 1 \pmod{4}. \text{ Set } n = pq \text{ and } T = \begin{pmatrix} a & b \\ -b & a \end{pmatrix}, A = \begin{pmatrix} a & -b \\ b & a \end{pmatrix} \text{ with } AT = \begin{pmatrix} p & 0 \\ 0 & p \end{pmatrix} = pI.$$

Now, we can replace p with $n = pq$ in the above scheme, and use the new matrix A to generate the public key $pk = (n, B_i, i \in [\tau])$. We observe that the security of this modification depends on the hardness of factoring $n = pq$.

4.2 Efficiency and Security.

Efficiency: The size of the public key is $O(\lambda^3 \log \lambda)$, the size of the secret key is $O(\lambda^2)$, the expansion rate of ciphertext to plaintext is $O(\lambda^2)$. To implement FHE, one only needs to add ciphertexts of the secret key to the public key.

Security: It is not feasible to use brute force attack by guessing noise term r because $|r| = O(2^\lambda)$. A possible attack is to solve the following equation

$$\begin{cases} TB_1 = r_1 T \bmod p \\ TB_2 = r_2 T \bmod p \\ \vdots \\ TB_\tau = r_\tau T \bmod p \end{cases}$$

However this system consists of quadratic equations when r_i is unknown. So, to solve this equation, we also require to guess r_i . As well as we know, attacking the above scheme is not feasible by using algebraic equation method.

At the same time, the above scheme can avoid the lattice attack of this paper because the matrix B_i is approximate multiple of the corresponding secret key A .

The above improvement scheme has more efficient, but we currently can not reduce its security to solving the secret key.

5. Conclusion

This paper presents a heuristic attack for the FHE in [DGHV10] by directly calling LLL algorithm. Our method concentrates on recovering the plaintext in a ciphertext, whereas the attacks considering in [DGHV10] mainly discussed how to avoid to recovering the secret key. Moreover, our attack applies the average-case performance of lattice reduction algorithm, whereas the security of their scheme depends upon the worst-case performance of lattice reduction algorithm.

Our result shows that the FHE scheme in [DGHV10] is not secure for some parameter settings. According to our experiment, one can avoid the above lattice attack by setting parameter $\gamma = \lambda^6$. But, the scheme is less practical in this case.

In addition, we also design an improvement scheme to avoid the above lattice attack.

Reference

- [AKS01] Miklos Ajtai, Ravi Kumar, and D. Sivakumar. A sieve algorithm for the shortest lattice vector problem. In STOC, pages 601–610. ACM, 2001.
- [Coh93] H. Cohen, A Course in Computational Algebraic Number Theory, Graduate Texts in Mathematics, 138. Springer, 1993.
- [BGV11] Z. Brakerski, C. Gentry, and V. Vaikuntanathan. Fully homomorphic encryption without bootstrapping, Cryptology ePrint Archive, Report 2011/277, 2011, <http://eprint.iacr.org/2011/277.pdf>.
- [CJMNT11] J.-S. Coron, A. Joux, A. Mandal, D. Naccache, and M. Tibouchi. Cryptanalysis of the rsa subgroup assumption from TCC 2005. In Public Key Cryptography - Proc. PKC 2011, volume 6571 of Lecture Notes in Computer Science, pages 147–155. Springer, 2011.
- [CMNT11] J.-S. Coron, A. Mandal, D. Naccache, and M. Tibouchi. Fully homomorphic

- encryption over the integers with shorter public-keys. In Advances in Cryptology - Proc. CRYPTO 2011, volume 6841 of Lecture Notes in Computer Science. Springer, 2011.
- [CN11] Y. Chen and P. Q. Nguyen. Faster algorithms for approximate common divisors: Breaking fully homomorphic encryption challenges over the integers, Cryptology ePrint Archive, Report 2011/436, 2011, <http://eprint.iacr.org/2011/436>.
- [DGHV10] M. van Dijk, C. Gentry, S. Halevi, and V. Vaikuntanathan. Fully homomorphic encryption over the integers. In Proc. of Eurocrypt, volume 6110 of LNCS, pages 24-43. Springer, 2010.
- [Gen01] C. Gentry. Key Recovery and Message Attacks on NTRU-Composite. Eurocrypt'01, LNCS 2045, pages 182-194.
- [Gen09] C. Gentry. Fully homomorphic encryption using ideal lattices. In Proc. of STOC, pages 169-178, 2009.
- [GH11a] Craig Gentry and Shai Halevi. Implementing Gentry's fully-homomorphic encryption scheme. In Kenneth Paterson, editor, Advances in Cryptology — EUROCRYPT 2011, volume 6632 of Lecture Notes in Computer Science, pages 129–148, Berlin, Heidelberg, New York, 2011. Springer Verlag. Cryptology ePrint Archive: Report 2010/520: <http://eprint.iacr.org/2010/520>.
- [GH11b] C. Gentry and S. Halevi, Fully homomorphic encryption without squashing using depth-3 arithmetic circuits, Cryptology ePrint Archive, Report 2011/279.
- [GHN06] N. Gama, N. Howgrave-Graham, H. Koy, and P. Q. Nguyen. Rankin's constant and blockwise lattice reduction. In CRYPTO, pages 112–130, 2006.
- [GN08a] N. Gama and P. Nguyen, Finding Short Lattice Vectors within Mordell's Inequality, In Proc. of the ACM Symposium on Theory of Computing STOC'08, pp. 208–216, 2008.
- [GN08b] N. Gama and P.Q. Nguyen, Predicting lattice reduction, in Proc. EUROCRYPT 2008, LNCS 4965, Springer-Verlag, pp. 31–51, 2008.
- [GS02] C. Gentry, M. Szydlo. Cryptanalysis of the Revised NTRU Signature Scheme. Eurocrypt'02, LNCS 2332, pages 299-320.
- [HPS98] J. Hoffstein, J. Pipher, J. H. Silverman. NTRU: A Ring-Based Public Key Cryptosystem. LNCS 1423, pages 267-288, 1998.
- [LLL82] H.W. Lenstra Jr., A.K. Lenstra and L. Lov'asz, Factoring polynomials with rational coefficients, Mathematische Annalen 261, pp. 515–534, 1982.
- [Mic07] D. Micciancio, Generalized compact knapsaks, cyclic lattices, and efficient one-way functions. Computational Complexity, 16(4):365-411.
- [MV10] D. Micciancio P. Voulgari, Faster exponential time algorithms for the shortest vector problem, SODA 2010, Electronic Colloquium on Computational Complexity, Report No. 65 (2009).
- [NS00] P. Nguyen and J. Stern, Lattice Reduction in Cryptology: An Update, in Proc. of Algorithm Number Theory (ANTS IV), LNCS 1838, pages 85-112. Springer-Verlag, 2000.
- [NS06] P.Q. Nguyen and D. Stehle, LLL on the average, proc. Of ANTS VII, 2006, LNCS 4076, pp. 238-256.
- [RAD78] R. Rivest, L. Adleman, and M. Dertouzos. On data banks and privacy homomorphisms. In Foundations of Secure Computation, pages 169-180, 1978.
- [Sch87] C.P. Schnorr. A hierarchy of polynomial time lattice basis reduction algorithms. Theoretical Computer Science, 53, pp. 201–224, 1987.

- [Sch03] C.P. Schnorr, Lattice Reduction by Random Sampling and Birthday Methods. Proceedings STACS 2003, LNCS 2607, pages 145-156.
- [SS10] D. Stehle and R. Steinfeld. Faster Fully Homomorphic Encryption. Cryptology ePrint Archive: Report 2010/299; <http://eprint.iacr.org/2010/299>.
- [SV10] Nigel P. Smart and Frederik Vercauteren. Fully homomorphic encryption with relatively small key and ciphertext sizes. In Public Key Cryptography – PKC 2010, volume 6056 of Lecture Notes in Computer Science, pages 420–443, Berlin, Heidelberg, New York, 2010. Springer Verlag.

Appendix

Here we present a toy example to show the attack processing in this paper.

Assume $\lambda = 3$, $\rho = 3$, $\eta = 3 \times 3^2$, $\gamma = 3^5$, and $\tau = 246$. The secret key is

$p = 134217729$. The public key pk is

```
[14010527899310104915077361405897655856954579259894401235416931662794471467
****32506244927968164359969318887725121412264319555364207379386105590943814
72****-61668018253619289544406191129075715793507248873031838028953930564122
66189****38927141623997301663870195059801004055109082189522204461457545694
6680171****7297145954097706021913940547389339956678019870767415691933823917
88378629****-30140457344626604907579495600823072252232199359703539812608633
9305890421****-198039757395521807886526608072264557416820515735678022945202
5195354817820****-617125236542825931469309400681208216141848713368988343043
5009695024807072****-314344724456047052407343043408844666369696926387730341
4205945241278676736****-873650667075946688621744141808551515776371375520393
505618087627422587406****-5661168717031627007850558362083804903558788886794
176445355379682688910349****30332042166890573283978942136211465207658275535
18578073761359734805150017****-30599639629274071100875783774253822818323774
24563292183331667391617245338****377518992692665033260320262796931302684111
4587259495227768564459897302000****-602505671843287205560429368109725013582
9510209439555808422352974191399388****6763448644568304758244751149882262168
427403425012104198632216541146186520****43291631893418224189644931321568726
90912140128638518271106678567196791969****366385414764461945789706576688701
4377637049690758932503955703872805828158****6440880339223906908108938864863
052034513651946363428003991648513062002965****-4974311372710821868924307908
738050767871452376853232321769440071681428910****30961075575378262183832103
5904466679022952996964095569513990204112782637****4113598743532238700496752
097591052168374627432273591547382338028915538447****-2965592531570108896306
815542410444724674255339620147254641588706805265875****30002227770025267391
85891000088487105999014311115341163533423735960260448****678689740309413453
4533013052616306218273301665668499059266421763674152516****-488122982551147
678156746142402235227982595672304581914582176843266989485****-833738745194
```

333061366341717042061148501976564139759009870084454456527257****69121095564
16932955238616827044793514141996144932568841447564201361220326****372487628
143764023518499278667384121694717581242751910333037574619681918****-483098
9279881589641800850063563446860654173481021189969240348597706270293****4343
01000293836536203991940196546368483454423110776137595757626709908480****-44
29866702460333153153756362730636088925479012702063909293582423662168942****
3085453373300086999038525086562434538237700869467988275252812015174528201**
**129022909858729481661479871168529130260180061799116292527231012665273864*
***-69655158906360626481385109145334455945277321521027925864745111362414757
22****287909033608209074646471105439706662606646843319030070486414901836285
5901****-470279667653424510554457455411828872378527455396028801770918322273
5491445****-59042285041100694838289036102829363655455298886601941040198960
1525964217****4973025390919351667746428837714935897984817309684591162468961
558033108788****13197793188905477151185846754305058379215626226020823041180
31135871168848****-29763031934767436025796048947518526262569279851236981623
2857371183389208****2618459004145048320285355851179180516584209114642345881
759646269617599778****-2927997298448524692358584354924598966335899494380161
992505262447665795686****-4725038281081535969401783160321378421525130125861
557119011312808094948875****-2552741460565209336080529869913902740291919180
877419180066395550035732110****39016999248830187759342013008764039708394431
34981144173229113424553421555****-44672799102518361383108087386133388859772
40118016229771105299692130819004****-84473559971894142356630707378731863974
7098651711461963768614791487685939****-429563007975019674357944964604856533
5047362205344284510296661540961668560****-302925771559139634499571058859516
6721290477519576873874082532569637566811****6743265036949190043228216402657
609198348578396748570110058646286561550543****44164609573073289334296519710
54734413104103520885402330266172078909629007****-31740161814318120132626229
19689487063225445177829741329126617029470565229****-84841651487839378161413
004233472935238625708659671954489696104067359451****-6371574178038219068357
493091440044997772518379397980142053423197654742523****-69811174141255611231
4212630439466410069224084511339565606726353593679641****-139885310957537355
8878863462248773819221655910678546125803561319483634703****2945037657265817
814517278448645241121603239592022319035129433362668508455****12408795266068
99322219801421636998955880138912594509904319162569086667857****486896033932
5554234380039989131843620158243256261608186078479856339074704****3721152048
92980564367094511168938831814800801161086330250146384313490514****10162325
3478917056088653753041311280906730560837159389315678238139697417****-219125
5043960951781069576869658423835653672100077160343571960626800209324****-382
814616510531185583457144960985806864456405953424904673585819406788176****-
4343502742461802469930334275441842753822829993846006479180986906729375801**
**-318497000388442771932146182408217788535626694157128314499083373857008998
1****2978083133771623905791631747499294383318411053992580039129891078222603
4****-356462996984457903970422283055007166075556725520151182652370638367280
7036****-117814514750145236247023144463391452133517967475281727880254620941

4597740****-540461964151349087138710622365992939478471801487208382428212328
131439279****44493674969757118022960475250416072148780316595046124594206140
74500866931****-10031921904170748502790075030647503575973627829163271687698
8882286796962****5247773905144915577982791469360230589831375237870854888767
524397506943584****-2584569190538017487001826401288424459027320189802441680
55908533434531683****134590686292907772800743059561179098352402182763509629
9649213998287557280****683255530698354154208184847496699552786581776950053
518279338143787925699****43442925010418412475312779378277600676558352980546
4653675096351740238236****356554903590954899718853011389275447748976218990
5206078585638441284819171****-207286014469793550405428408809991800101450794
9879746907252468336462488550****-673334346277495619662501607699399732377199
1492479736716366866887413510217****-358329992334082705842425464041628799094
1709779364478909690368947803954208****6682643999107438559671179379427649608
917551047900916341999771762396610861****-7377727757231209119527417478030262
65258949486210293698339387767016804920****302321985815027490801517626477758
9151708320807983293431233738844754048984****2400932510687386923986585045553
192543503670547686615780717569708854208292****38327962658987702321887629204
87499556300343004765916334878279938869351822****-42182946718981026744151217
41626893985448030459569333657287815766710468427****-34761657508175848729172
54296945444074279141900589101366823642109002878829****-24609879743866092092
92111104240733560462085593151930154717259122559580789****318376685501183132
0481850948450573287122987833022138954070804543650033862****-294539773890330
0748189082170868815464339482523418905283351288588318836318****5890719328675
177385219820193568896652554744400598695098332493882871977667****-1037438217
033670891075104502854407883086351147181638497695145629664678410****23161238
03328243058169233098571879121296068907575335292078207500886192478****-37836
24052802107436036940508974529614791450145443915120710146311154511382****-517
1268880357553376366628432578209109554163485323910727133622370241916214****7
94947995124913096894099157258564785481749904007494502002573313040999971****
1208254626840488506796597177519942825697390609922401113896590563533718765**
**6536099941257584124067896206552947050206357170228600275046746285551957746
****-6158242675910238398303325112702239850580422717956325571266899460220375
090****34329110107151794792514133258973658984233479662135949431219423240163
74824****493464290518497142259847452039217930103818621193524703197637581750
4175271****-647577701749314883559958894743301728238055335298892032742674286
6741870600****5905135478792743696084018774990129015486062601910993982882500
157846480771****52496021648614562082212569155496934558359706862960250886779
25341891486724****-24105894205245179362701772248942644028712239389685739479
70536614754041444****130026398545305270326223043518994613604748762985180740
1332074583297159868****2223837875999897095951213297127277006231149825053015
35934397442660338931****-10778900596708693545016093415952119222902944599889
04710660928615743819218****370267802804320200831629711007978381181523471209
6459791554622717471128055****4283112251856729709152424580349747696090571890
510258934075182270418985838****31847736711311702466166647305234036299765374

02417479232497920193950013614****-18044366619428829597608810401481706232318
01138791257119437085702886608274****-16353706589928454641656639209430889860
15637374194605760947609411154767191****-34122870423766141314894306174613236
65681462804021888303121320979544895210****-19429030847793062015542223208892
6546171437524577150816004447300727438427****404639194147024293566817148289
8762103158759747977472560345966088252774919****-168734739583849562821140550
6269651756400201409842966154510075174007137888****4794860450857076494883320
111320196918422144174269953871296363857120826287****27530459270838957613836
33261665254163899105876736107886965719577648253850****-38480633817880172098
06858207864190850352215531845558108576432453975165083****505882214698905872
9086478256755512514152589022104036428175629106819970309****3238895771108565
951758749062625303658741790055730038514572234190247737603****-1710086495650
458379762604852596780233481114350953546845713342608866722865****11799451009
41351187110712125298398105089610827865453172930041991829778662****346505614
4859658681110347184269581953903343031221799371090025284248677910****6088148
10050692496928119574804298152809676862048717552523262989106455026****-61037
39074373825622656651628155737376664665710121307674376868759938638681****197
7283434785242586034193225733547218205476098338503844223818741794432485****2
292947040432187775101637443316960210096221320403123969536578696582052801***
5606254346995472854276971778442763013370411853379175208863771466333722327
***-46209687733581641490210473591868387145103083405857003253021586778793034
68****-37014483829595262336700490750122718643702939658862497597053150820103
17451****-10160372489540278260386801643134293111642958947654401961334837688
89209203****4583747752962614505367778034383401055745436898034899499215115
4939763088****6731343041643839027192470921691467449212726232981835890937279
669390502595****-4974792658090714406331898927099583098474530386726606685140
581991524292439****6323324597851013886340744111848213662536091403934283653
38900014943720275****-14066787917294212901682178667499911136957065648450670
1840226752500743531****-329214852376141981869061601848161883563053216196396
2233535761528074278880****4537816167493383437592746835571837800127463174996
89809956278872784999492****421549114631201287503199373051819100003929952180
6292975931651554463185958****2703047951971855770992984826607187698647269590
527482396798928373814354133****61774651689601192585396216799131069204115500
73308986819114157940063494710****144282493025516846197051129297397695391704
2601380985376867812424038062595****2394972473174630781749951332851927416970
373757597880697282585699691325915****57318570298591630763184503452817538332
38142595228249732562176523171167941****-12393086709471418493045485305099720
07809452814009033964293844428891438013****-25631895142081205571200657720796
02481383969017178836132191704706126501637****-66461277004723628372502928761
43045395841518676566068110238862480478180958****323879690074601678422397282
3902976036457393723305143144878270434507325034****-440085032347675088164864
54953951772417041836617030896191087494191285555****-15473689442306306867094
16906507927342740497164496654914690296196911496106****216885319337982122225
3757740738405414651881053021300345074360496026961147****-578426752768943915

7616263351822789734387414843562317084463328508977933176****-218129879811312
65361092073119698163600697885954021367464883374422454591****89960316468422
9652540988767016341541079859725348786339094924995367823588****-293073428917
505131737681508307073747950103507564065931617593183449459079****63842592940
09307807592478090601031188097161700896010499984381232052924462****179786967
4327514030310565670256913936930560278916428637693806560628430536****-474623
1159565794461388186646710810043904841533822055413758008688496598133****-290
6195810530300542335582637251423362984618981579006382070478621590151909****5
803998123311226027759698992595849737065395642355716565011370393908954189***
2693382085931466081508642774365001777542759923744565790931572374148948102
***-46719558980422136694832905930542718820812079592775128781957070587499863
79****280446693743567128323840872140024300922262436357692336176603624353720
8542****3324002237075738651159067522079172611729239485094504570883372144094
733919****-3911591599851218062191825928015676602570980566358033321130376714
626000703****25965174893214709505842411296486390743544676304955488174623052
19069082221****657191637256559217978148969945375250153490358771709295158007
96197391532****620770789743513142751251834670879173848331838926532630517638
1562658488080****-242562487151159090244959594779093435442850336825725046485
2588504384390314****-411491072229461361520601703991865123616319707934462829
8424776544698953986****6067821307969645430056465136230114987352126895523154
683695781591603561104****-2133677020645229820449576387686129911282190848937
097431272121333119740710****24005916761527698350423525172110297883289733421
31679443493387860326767953****195698877131888537349656570675292201909699391
8539259619253129478137682552****-648560586886890670698888574274215434606119
5149758365163601859518028515971****4404029878818596053651267534637569063233
696226881564778616608783650219983****-1760522782284460375079538981561438012
397545448146653305625381660352583018****-5883697409017386014029072891955594
021866666137100254079977609861752004591****12828209756945805363618176771956
52748244112166039584308488741529018652597****-60068101932628867334730802704
62837805110653229081304629712616836349796659****-96931986428087161387046321
5044898137085063784386093010590483229017918724****-415224682148098051897893
0701022651302347991807869186030271812518549210828****6115049617829066781139
625471598654691279076911284065939077575835082151312****-3582284292535142650
766885041924356001922341663722388170009130693850371655****-6109616276284967
476949882832474617586495754354083557421855161737798447303****34605361857436
6721232145972528107315047339229691188942440901358096489671****-304951663851
2898991055372196992991779682360214374535077965278535423386917****2425082385
720622817683683910704640113429340552003094395090130449181480327****28211792
82639579493514998851690522697278774768379459790006878281644487381****295096
3417697699890060885221159568465896463907591657601823770069647398176****6409
24688511294541723655365039625212377385245925970959900512329872801843****32
450096291730997134918105970842343873952045820400643471563333171012312****
4002905124328973782650304832296357312635926070389930394295441249877692694**
**-565259019587550919314993354704360075875778475465892081850810356785621919

3****7598412910141921857561163792398141236390576164963240427552152914602438
56****332535926389151523573732298896664880084718594624037889228422708183898
6072****445469236653244870943914324330679746743820155778655158843950685415
262350****-6601062884846417891879272868786659560202678833629424666136478632
660447240****37166315949346069241642199995347193397883958747512295307332216
71643782170****123689319223817772962638315968178003594555150162812042159810
2922892453866****1612446982714989622320246948322485465601199075622097670463
089418266878200****-3926023814034921915554630488031263155829114668155405146
870812352980151855****-1886947799712604640958938793892442898335909404180114
467521848195015148824****-6822159997840124693829508148736587080473490634010
35415745091459191812390****588993023785537556963852725422442074990500599553
9202456304880811878512547****-529354683958828669084944332624003260613184147
3650402241738505495673077236****-597917361105885896578491554967051396265145
2427945412139134271212133925614****-159343645732901543526315534035601053662
221830960476510617861651768038119****10008401318638240757704679708239415851
85311537326121174050912065708832666****526478771285427649824712845833777249
1398965534209903682821389603795028343****-672005513047781634369956318992112
919863392381110985069084083875088474731****2948564026606264879092900392634
880619907802168921959510684410385391349191****38914579255394636419254545847
58481567622192776097758268275613780169729305****334447473216037956868904506
9995799655509067237692445924839941364758145142****-571376066176687918631997
2299683530585628527838025651917155479895225872620****-581348793934927237844
1256727908004257002812844400683832807978680450901433****-324366020689897318
7375815297536510254610303218614173869280762125054371585****-644169259364777
0729250533826968098133125966723419008417753483064862643282****-435150649382
1313893742532909582986246027387822070247862428900658150549777****-355915415
8711033193161000229948101277947713860697675166384247616647170322****-557896
9794331437138028332915653309965533089166122917427409616732685771948****-473
4714094685487338147886763963121855252450865430203756011018865861908853****-
2428201399383130458681275708372397922112027158877311222049557118076158914**
**5079435455944786633586655825943792108240163301196236775752137659310214813
****-3874457366159390256779682624375683731372930093261472390833348512563659
174****-1576248259182306080975435472568639899304163226558986563225276228009
318114****-3617859949415074220166275399759135846797704625829482897448261161
603678974****31886013139486422625440274143822924080931402871626741214996597
60607357032****573062586411690167583613006706073482240892907913458988154148
0046771543753****-553659386145736494235324490205917552612265056124108931785
7772311113652636****1533825856398390745696096978823707439073528858650112746
7123004833701592****4466890572809180313236589437201306744081540345391910608
877098548181826460****46782561318975314739014007484419800430086392936909397
08512183249968607087****-52503755949310824872420279284545022183641590575108
26521425297659369801507****434196090289962138013330748854830541146285664207
3255798550763657721695349****-502793245900738819100099657399322888386874331
0699584444900112214668799970****7382106921817153500831697383062242938121595

91627831190636770563222467121****-38572970228695463135441526795671827926051
 49427110103780679557956298703351****110068350462068250943689071554265570561
 2690416550520944338747526750907164****2567012614359545699103925355645788358
 033976936113512163346474830334195259****-1801766642742734776470113001010844
 470698120042253165416407787786060297744****16460595207280505429710646891864
 21708561004359998173781458855498948087914****-18069411244994048834747819599
 8426928514095541348403506850299687916597745]

The lattice L_1 is as follows.

C=

[[-196848789281973859727465844151315553725055119450697291705147663567242373 1
 0]
 [-3250624492796816435996931888772512141226431955536420737938610559094381472
 0 1 0]
 [6166801825361928954440619112907571579350724887303183802895393056412266189 0
 0 1 0]
 [-3892714162399730166387019505980100405510908218952222044614575456946680171
 0 0 0 1 0]
 [-729714595409770602191394054738933995667801987076741569193382391788378629 0
 0 0 0 1 0]
 [301404573446266049075794956008230722522321993597035398126086339305890421 0
 0 0 0 0 1 0]
 [1980397573955218078865266080722645574168205157356780229452025195354817820 0
 0 0 0 0 0 1 0]
 [6171252365428259314693094006812082161418487133689883430435009695024807072 0
 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0]
 [3143447244560470524073430434088446663696969263877303414205945241278676736 0
 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0]
 [873650667075946688621744141808551515776371375520393505618087627422587406 0
 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0]
 [566116871703162700785055836208380490355878886794176445355379682688910349 0
 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0]
 [-3033204216689057328397894213621146520765827553518578073761359734805150017
 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0]
 [305996396292740711008757837742538228183237742456329218331667391617245338 0
 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0]
 [-377518992692665033260320262796931302684114587259495227768564459897302000
 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]
 [6025056718432872055604293681097250135829510209439555808422352974191399388 0
 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]
 [-6763448644568304758244751149882262168427403425012104198632216541146186520
 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]
 [-4329163189341822418964493132156872690912140128638518271106678567196791969
 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]

```

[-3663854147644619457897065766887014377637049690758932503955703872805828158
0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]
[-6440880339223906908108938864863052034513651946363428003991648513062002965
0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]
[4974311372710821868924307908738050767871452376853232321769440071681428910 0
0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]
[-309610755753782621838321035904466679022952996964095569513990204112782637 0
0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]
[-4113598743532238700496752097591052168374627432273591547382338028915538447
0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]
[2965592531570108896306815542410444724674255339620147254641588706805265875 0
0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]
[-3000222777002526739185891000088487105999014311115341163533423735960260448
0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]
[-6786897403094134534533013052616306218273301665668499059266421763674152516
0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]
[4881229825511476781567461424022352227982595672304581914582176843266989485 0
0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]
[833738745194333061366341717042061148501976564139759009870084454456527257 0
0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0]
[-14010527899310104915077361405897655856954579259894401235416931662794471467
0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 0 1]
]

```

By calling LLL algorithm, the reduced basis of L_1 is

```

B=[[ -86 122 -65 -175 -90 -182 113 79 41 46 -225 99 -72 164 -66 -376 5 -55 167 -159 94 96
33 -63 -1 -42 -39 -92 0]
[-87 -49 65 -321 -209 49 11 -30 29 48 -149 181 12 109 -153 -237 -43 -83 10 79 177 -120
-127 171 17 100 -89 -52 4]
[175 75 -43 -80 36 -86 14 -147 -111 -180 -60 -5 -181 308 -98 -114 115 -96 150 -151 184 293
48 -39 2 8 57 52 -4]
[-153 -21 -61 172 138 198 -31 -188 -3 107 61 47 260 42 30 -55 -82 64 -91 -52 -31 179 -59
-104 -113 72 -25 -6 9]
[77 149 -12 60 242 89 212 23 90 126 73 -40 56 -135 91 -49 -68 -8 116 103 100 91 100 80 -55
-114 57 -45 -5]
[-169 55 -115 362 140 102 -157 23 -69 84 -9 4 145 4 5 97 110 -113 -22 76 -59 -83 34 -88 -71
107 9 39 14]
[-23 -143 -137 54 -184 7 -209 32 -67 234 -9 179 345 6 -7 -109 -143 40 -2 89 -164 -110 -109
-11 -80 128 -48 79 18]
[-62 -66 -64 -232 64 131 1 -175 -42 -107 -145 170 26 234 -154 -95 119 124 -128 -281 211
111 55 -82 -7 91 -68 -87 -38]
[-155 167 -110 86 -19 -102 96 108 120 178 -113 33 -161 -32 -9 -187 -33 -62 145 66 87 -149
-39 -96 176 62 -115 -206 10]
[-31 -5 56 2 97 146 -42 -213 -88 -2 -173 -99 74 214 -64 -53 -50 -156 -16 -51 21 96 -244 150
]
```

-60 -31 -53 157 85]
 [-56 40 -21 109 -73 -140 -97 3 -28 -255 2 -59 -10 -161 196 2 -14 -76 242 -66 -33 60 3 -19
 -136 -66 119 69 -14]
 [-223 -35 50 -147 5 -171 -72 52 3 94 -53 103 -4 204 -69 -250 -76 66 -56 79 -28 23 -256 -68
 24 21 69 10 9]
 [144 -22 -83 -257 -39 -19 16 -39 -131 64 -34 -75 -137 11 -97 76 9 -168 -214 89 64 -125 -8
 -189 52 34 28 20 -38]
 [-168 98 -91 42 18 -101 365 217 -31 -108 -110 62 14 -63 70 -9 45 -70 -129 91 108 -34 89 38
 -85 10 -110 -162 -4]
 [-146 -28 -46 -3 7 -61 197 106 -149 -57 -17 -77 57 2 -74 147 19 -23 -98 223 -120 -166 58 -69
 -130 -63 177 -90 -44]
 [84 42 137 -208 195 108 130 8 72 16 -40 -25 9 -102 -114 43 -115 78 7 97 39 -272 -52 -87
 -181 -136 60 -19 -6]
 [-169 3 -26 -42 50 -16 4 222 184 224 -115 202 -127 -97 21 -88 198 53 121 88 11 -81 83 60
 105 38 48 -55 -43]
 [-15 -105 183 181 -118 53 -54 39 51 56 -63 -106 -43 14 56 153 -43 103 140 -99 -207 -63
 -129 -100 32 -45 -122 -72 35]
 [186 16 12 -98 126 -94 45 37 -140 -12 -16 68 -26 240 -18 30 -121 47 168 127 21 -25 -51 154
 -151 -16 -23 -35 -5]
 [-31 -5 -119 190 -1 -34 -9 126 -23 34 103 104 86 -82 55 -60 -127 106 29 43 -53 -1 -118 11
 115 136 38 86 47]
 [224 110 -166 50 225 142 -73 -94 29 38 77 -84 9 51 -127 83 -74 16 154 9 -5 53 237 15 65 -8
 154 -52 3]
 [-16 12 93 -44 16 319 -146 -30 -26 88 118 124 112 41 -47 -134 6 -130 -56 96 136 90 77 174
 -19 69 48 -128 -16]
 [25 -25 -142 43 -65 -23 54 -45 -159 -148 118 103 143 46 145 -223 -107 27 72 21 88 148 -72
 21 -54 62 40 17 -79]
 [-35 -45 -4 27 -343 -109 -73 32 62 -25 -196 76 118 -39 26 -241 -147 132 198 -112 -90 -10
 122 -113 -126 -137 -51 -31 25]
 [47 -69 4 85 -139 -116 90 148 81 -221 -62 -172 86 -206 126 323 8 266 -45 -106 -136 -123
 163 100 -120 -51 15 -132 9]
 [129 -13 -17 100 360 214 -2 -63 -90 23 -68 -87 53 -157 14 181 31 100 28 87 130 -87 -111 -22
 46 7 146 -32 -99]
 [-201 -65 -109 -13 -128 -179 -83 50 -60 56 109 105 -12 51 35 -111 -18 242 19 -119 -109 230
 2 3 1 -33 -85 -11 -12]
 [32662 1532013 35166 -334620 -492845 319870 -62472 -112310 -73327 -101190 -187515
 444100 363631 224003 356632 512681 263715 351591 -34152 266919 -280216 127712
 -299356 -168344 363922 -258533 45283 138299 -195047]]
 When calling LLL algorithm, generating matrix U is as follows.
 $U = [[122 -65 -175 -90 -182 113 79 41 46 -225 99 -72 164 -66 -376 5 -55 167 -159 94 96 33
 -63 -1 -42 -39 -92 0]$
 $[-49 65 -321 -209 49 11 -30 29 48 -149 181 12 109 -153 -237 -43 -83 10 79 177 -120 -127
 171 17 100 -89 -52 4]$
 $[75 -43 -80 36 -86 14 -147 -111 -180 -60 -5 -181 308 -98 -114 115 -96 150 -151 184 293 48$

-39 2 8 57 52 -4]
 [-21 -61 172 138 198 -31 -188 -3 107 61 47 260 42 30 -55 -82 64 -91 -52 -31 179 -59 -104
 -113 72 -25 -6 9]
 [149 -12 60 242 89 212 23 90 126 73 -40 56 -135 91 -49 -68 -8 116 103 100 91 100 80 -55
 -114 57 -45 -5]
 [55 -115 362 140 102 -157 23 -69 84 -9 4 145 4 5 97 110 -113 -22 76 -59 -83 34 -88 -71 107
 9 39 14]
 [-143 -137 54 -184 7 -209 32 -67 234 -9 179 345 6 -7 -109 -143 40 -2 89 -164 -110 -109 -11
 -80 128 -48 79 18]
 [-66 -64 -232 64 131 1 -175 -42 -107 -145 170 26 234 -154 -95 119 124 -128 -281 211 111 55
 -82 -7 91 -68 -87 -38]
 [167 -110 86 -19 -102 96 108 120 178 -113 33 -161 -32 -9 -187 -33 -62 145 66 87 -149 -39
 -96 176 62 -115 -206 10]
 [-5 56 2 97 146 -42 -213 -88 -2 -173 -99 74 214 -64 -53 -50 -156 -16 -51 21 96 -244 150 -60
 -31 -53 157 85]
 [40 -21 109 -73 -140 -97 3 -28 -255 2 -59 -10 -161 196 2 -14 -76 242 -66 -33 60 3 -19 -136
 -66 119 69 -14]
 [-35 50 -147 5 -171 -72 52 3 94 -53 103 -4 204 -69 -250 -76 66 -56 79 -28 23 -256 -68 24 21
 69 10 9]
 [-22 -83 -257 -39 -19 16 -39 -131 64 -34 -75 -137 11 -97 76 9 -168 -214 89 64 -125 -8 -189
 52 34 28 20 -38]
 [98 -91 42 18 -101 365 217 -31 -108 -110 62 14 -63 70 -9 45 -70 -129 91 108 -34 89 38 -85
 10 -110 -162 -4]
 [-28 -46 -3 7 -61 197 106 -149 -57 -17 -77 57 2 -74 147 19 -23 -98 223 -120 -166 58 -69 -130
 -63 177 -90 -44]
 [42 137 -208 195 108 130 8 72 16 -40 -25 9 -102 -114 43 -115 78 7 97 39 -272 -52 -87 -181
 -136 60 -19 -6]
 [3 -26 -42 50 -16 4 222 184 224 -115 202 -127 -97 21 -88 198 53 121 88 11 -81 83 60 105 38
 48 -55 -43]
 [-105 183 181 -118 53 -54 39 51 56 -63 -106 -43 14 56 153 -43 103 140 -99 -207 -63 -129
 -100 32 -45 -122 -72 35]
 [16 12 -98 126 -94 45 37 -140 -12 -16 68 -26 240 -18 30 -121 47 168 127 21 -25 -51 154 -151
 -16 -23 -35 -5]
 [-5 -119 190 -1 -34 -9 126 -23 34 103 104 86 -82 55 -60 -127 106 29 43 -53 -1 -118 11 115
 136 38 86 47]
 [110 -166 50 225 142 -73 -94 29 38 77 -84 9 51 -127 83 -74 16 154 9 -5 53 237 15 65 -8 154
 -52 3]
 [12 93 -44 16 319 -146 -30 -26 88 118 124 112 41 -47 -134 6 -130 -56 96 136 90 77 174 -19
 69 48 -128 -16]
 [-25 -142 43 -65 -23 54 -45 -159 -148 118 103 143 46 145 -223 -107 27 72 21 88 148 -72 21
 -54 62 40 17 -79]
 [-45 -4 27 -343 -109 -73 32 62 -25 -196 76 118 -39 26 -241 -147 132 198 -112 -90 -10 122
 -113 -126 -137 -51 -31 25]
 [-69 4 85 -139 -116 90 148 81 -221 -62 -172 86 -206 126 323 8 266 -45 -106 -136 -123 163

100 -120 -51 15 -132 9]
 [-13 -17 100 360 214 -2 -63 -90 23 -68 -87 53 -157 14 181 31 100 28 87 130 -87 -111 -22 46
 7 146 -32 -99]
 [-65 -109 -13 -128 -179 -83 50 -60 56 109 105 -12 51 35 -111 -18 242 19 -119 -109 230 2 3 1
 -33 -85 -11 -12]
 [1532013 35166 -334620 -492845 319870 -62472 -112310 -73327 -101190 -187515 444100
 363631 224003 356632 512681 263715 351591 -34152 266919 -280216 127712 -299356
 -168344 363922 -258533 45283 138299 -195047]]

The above three matrices is satisfied to equality $U^*C=B$. Moreover, U is equal to B except for the first column.

Now, we can decide the plaintext bit in the ciphertext

-196848789281973859727465844151315553725055119450697291705147663567242373

according to the parity of the first column of U and B.

It is easy to check that they are respectively

$$[0\ 1\ 1\ 1\ 1\ 1\ 0\ 1\ 1\ 0\ 0\ 0\ 0\ 1\ 1\ 0\ 1\ 0\ 0\ 1\ 1\ 1\ 1\ 1], \\ [0\ 1\ 1\ 1\ 1\ 1\ 1\ 0\ 1\ 1\ 0\ 1\ 0\ 0\ 0\ 0\ 1\ 1\ 0\ 1\ 0\ 0\ 1\ 1\ 1\ 1\ 0].$$

So, the plaintext is “1” for the above ciphertext. This is because the first columns in U and B have same parity if the plaintext is “1” in a ciphertext and $\|U\|_\infty, \|B\|_\infty < 2^{x^2}$.

Notice that the last row vector in U is too large (that is $|y|, |y_i| > 2^{x^2}$), so the last terms in the parity vectors is not satisfied the above condition.

On the other hand, suppose the ciphertext is

-196848789281973859727465844151315553725055119450697291705147663567242374,

then calling LLL generates the matrices B, U as follows.

B=[[-110 112 -87 -84 7 1 161 -66 239 63 -181 -146 -205 80 -74 -63 37 -41 -18 34 85 75 7 106
 122 158 -27 45 1]
 [-2 5 73 41 131 -131 -125 153 -181 217 62 166 201 -63 -140 15 42 36 60 8 -148 -1 96 122
 -24 -46 149 170 1]
 [102 -33 -62 9 73 -207 127 -42 -273 170 1 130 185 164 -30 -172 -66 22 20 -128 -109 -132
 -110 -184 59 -71 84 122 1]
 [68 -152 186 187 -215 -37 129 59 14 -153 180 40 -52 203 6 88 139 96 -195 70 -129 -308 -57
 -56 139 78 -65 -48 0]
 [48 62 -104 -173 250 -14 -52 -73 -173 -23 173 -12 145 44 -217 -93 -62 152 -74 44 210 26 -25
 -155 -149 -166 172 167 1]
 [88 -57 169 30 -189 7 168 125 26 188 -254 -7 -79 60 -104 -38 133 121 -103 -52 -127 29 -138
 318 52 188 -111 58 -1]
 [-84 76 222 155 -108 -26 -197 25 -224 297 19 -53 77 -58 5 66 -51 -106 88 -73 -166 -13 37 22
 -175 26 -41 -158 -4]
 [76 124 -50 4 26 50 49 11 -199 159 -151 -101 -27 6 -104 -149 -14 -201 66 -222 -130 73 -150
 -68 33 -27 4 -273 0]
 [-94 -37 -17 -71 -51 -45 -65 -68 -89 -85 68 209 52 -21 85 -166 -81 111 -100 -162 43 -4 -175
 83 -53 150 -106 143 -1]
 [52 -22 64 -80 -114 -107 -63 231 71 -89 -26 108 -215 163 -112 -141 7 10 -78 36 -188 -41 -64

-1 85 95 -40 88 1]
 [-34 179 157 24 -63 12 -162 80 -57 -121 56 41 -36 -255 52 -139 -70 -116 24 -92 -60 21 138
 130 -209 -65 -12 -225 -28]
 [64 100 57 -25 0 35 -36 -82 -131 -40 115 -220 -85 179 -128 -129 -111 -56 -74 -61 48 -146 -60
 -55 181 -63 -31 -13 -27]
 [-4 2 80 -34 162 74 -169 179 -119 103 -21 -57 28 110 -103 103 -52 141 61 57 165 74 150 -70
 -48 -130 89 196 29]
 [62 -80 113 181 -168 -152 141 52 -279 -49 32 95 104 60 135 9 99 39 -107 -73 73 -170 -131 3
 34 67 -26 -148 -3]
 [132 -26 -46 43 -100 102 -85 134 130 -106 49 -5 -41 21 -251 30 130 104 -137 28 -94 -57
 -150 78 -12 123 -94 -47 62]
 [-14 27 240 137 29 -36 -56 147 -70 94 22 -133 17 -29 -210 193 139 267 -19 42 122 -1 -72
 160 -44 39 62 40 34]
 [36 8 80 103 -99 -167 -275 13 -142 210 85 50 82 68 106 32 73 -91 54 -91 -63 -195 85 87 63
 143 28 48 -23]
 [-54 -29 -138 31 -13 35 -94 -49 276 -20 -35 -77 -72 -74 293 46 7 -12 73 112 144 116 -53 91
 64 36 1 -89 40]
 [50 -15 -12 -100 42 -124 83 -70 98 19 91 31 -120 174 17 -96 109 175 -178 22 30 7 -108 89
 -70 -4 -7 207 47]
 [-16 -65 106 97 -79 -133 -87 42 43 161 179 185 48 -58 66 17 128 -71 -40 21 -273 -30 196 -89
 38 27 60 27 -51]
 [-16 20 190 14 2 -83 -192 111 -232 65 9 210 -12 72 -22 -60 3 79 7 -95 -131 136 -20 237 -182
 41 25 -180 13]
 [-8 -70 -124 17 -73 262 -62 138 3 3 -158 -42 72 -120 203 -14 221 -154 121 -97 148 314 -103
 46 -83 53 0 -172 -44]
 [-90 -41 -50 -64 -141 85 -20 164 190 -6 -1 5 -156 -46 7 90 34 79 -34 139 60 -60 -35 234 22
 46 -119 42 107]
 [110 1 107 54 -158 104 -96 -198 63 43 -81 -218 -101 -208 286 32 -121 35 36 -53 -81 163 91
 77 -209 -178 -5 -80 9]
 [-202 114 -93 1 164 -87 236 -150 147 -19 -82 42 21 156 6 -193 33 24 -38 -147 94 -91 3 -38
 53 -76 -11 -13 82]
 [-118 212 103 23 -78 -23 -224 -36 124 -62 94 -27 -185 73 -147 -125 -68 -12 -41 116 188 37
 216 71 -53 163 85 64 51]
 [-38 -34 288 71 -145 -145 -124 170 -21 74 202 50 76 -31 97 62 -80 64 -34 10 -89 14 -70 214
 -34 38 -80 90 75]
 [31795 1529484 34164 -326891 -481784 312328 -61101 -109858 -71653 -98959 -183586
 434089 355349 219063 348775 501243 257557 343487 -33138 260672 -273839 124941
 -292486 -164591 355578 -252847 44112 135082 -190712]]

U=[[112 -87 -84 7 1 161 -66 239 63 -181 -146 -205 80 -74 -63 37 -41 -18 34 85 75 7 106 122
 158 -27 45 1]
 [5 73 41 131 -131 -125 153 -181 217 62 166 201 -63 -140 15 42 36 60 8 -148 -1 96 122 -24
 -46 149 170 1]
 [-33 -62 9 73 -207 127 -42 -273 170 1 130 185 164 -30 -172 -66 22 20 -128 -109 -132 -110

-184 59 -71 84 122 1]
 [-152 186 187 -215 -37 129 59 14 -153 180 40 -52 203 6 88 139 96 -195 70 -129 -308 -57 -56
 139 78 -65 -48 0]
 [62 -104 -173 250 -14 -52 -73 -173 -23 173 -12 145 44 -217 -93 -62 152 -74 44 210 26 -25
 -155 -149 -166 172 167 1]
 [-57 169 30 -189 7 168 125 26 188 -254 -7 -79 60 -104 -38 133 121 -103 -52 -127 29 -138
 318 52 188 -111 58 -1]
 [76 222 155 -108 -26 -197 25 -224 297 19 -53 77 -58 5 66 -51 -106 88 -73 -166 -13 37 22
 -175 26 -41 -158 -4]
 [124 -50 4 26 50 49 11 -199 159 -151 -101 -27 6 -104 -149 -14 -201 66 -222 -130 73 -150 -68
 33 -27 4 -273 0]
 [-37 -17 -71 -51 -45 -65 -68 -89 -85 68 209 52 -21 85 -166 -81 111 -100 -162 43 -4 -175 83
 -53 150 -106 143 -1]
 [-22 64 -80 -114 -107 -63 231 71 -89 -26 108 -215 163 -112 -141 7 10 -78 36 -188 -41 -64 -1
 85 95 -40 88 1]
 [179 157 24 -63 12 -162 80 -57 -121 56 41 -36 -255 52 -139 -70 -116 24 -92 -60 21 138 130
 -209 -65 -12 -225 -28]
 [100 57 -25 0 35 -36 -82 -131 -40 115 -220 -85 179 -128 -129 -111 -56 -74 -61 48 -146 -60
 -55 181 -63 -31 -13 -27]
 [2 80 -34 162 74 -169 179 -119 103 -21 -57 28 110 -103 103 -52 141 61 57 165 74 150 -70
 -48 -130 89 196 29]
 [-80 113 181 -168 -152 141 52 -279 -49 32 95 104 60 135 9 99 39 -107 -73 73 -170 -131 3 34
 67 -26 -148 -3]
 [-26 -46 43 -100 102 -85 134 130 -106 49 -5 -41 21 -251 30 130 104 -137 28 -94 -57 -150 78
 -12 123 -94 -47 62]
 [27 240 137 29 -36 -56 147 -70 94 22 -133 17 -29 -210 193 139 267 -19 42 122 -1 -72 160
 -44 39 62 40 34]
 [8 80 103 -99 -167 -275 13 -142 210 85 50 82 68 106 32 73 -91 54 -91 -63 -195 85 87 63 143
 28 48 -23]
 [-29 -138 31 -13 35 -94 -49 276 -20 -35 -77 -72 -74 293 46 7 -12 73 112 144 116 -53 91 64
 36 1 -89 40]
 [-15 -12 -100 42 -124 83 -70 98 19 91 31 -120 174 17 -96 109 175 -178 22 30 7 -108 89 -70
 -4 -7 207 47]
 [-65 106 97 -79 -133 -87 42 43 161 179 185 48 -58 66 17 128 -71 -40 21 -273 -30 196 -89 38
 27 60 27 -51]
 [20 190 14 2 -83 -192 111 -232 65 9 210 -12 72 -22 -60 3 79 7 -95 -131 136 -20 237 -182 41
 25 -180 13]
 [-70 -124 17 -73 262 -62 138 3 3 -158 -42 72 -120 203 -14 221 -154 121 -97 148 314 -103 46
 -83 53 0 -172 -44]
 [-41 -50 -64 -141 85 -20 164 190 -6 -1 5 -156 -46 7 90 34 79 -34 139 60 -60 -35 234 22 46
 -119 42 107]
 [1 107 54 -158 104 -96 -198 63 43 -81 -218 -101 -208 286 32 -121 35 36 -53 -81 163 91 77
 -209 -178 -5 -80 9]
 [114 -93 1 164 -87 236 -150 147 -19 -82 42 21 156 6 -193 33 24 -38 -147 94 -91 3 -38 53 -76

$-11 \ -13 \ 82]$
 $[212 \ 103 \ 23 \ -78 \ -23 \ -224 \ -36 \ 124 \ -62 \ 94 \ -27 \ -185 \ 73 \ -147 \ -125 \ -68 \ -12 \ -41 \ 116 \ 188 \ 37 \ 216$
 $71 \ -53 \ 163 \ 85 \ 64 \ 51]$
 $[-34 \ 288 \ 71 \ -145 \ -145 \ -124 \ 170 \ -21 \ 74 \ 202 \ 50 \ 76 \ -31 \ 97 \ 62 \ -80 \ 64 \ -34 \ 10 \ -89 \ 14 \ -70 \ 214 \ -34$
 $38 \ -80 \ 90 \ 75]$
 $[1529484 \ 34164 \ -326891 \ -481784 \ 312328 \ -61101 \ -109858 \ -71653 \ -98959 \ -183586 \ 434089$
 $355349 \ 219063 \ 348775 \ 501243 \ 257557 \ 343487 \ -33138 \ 260672 \ -273839 \ 124941 \ -292486$
 $-164591 \ 355578 \ -252847 \ 44112 \ 135082 \ -190712]]$

Similarly, the above three matrices is satisfied to equality $U^*C=B$.

It is easy to check that the parity of the first columns of B and U are respectively

$$[0 \ 1]$$

$$[0 \ 1 \ 1 \ 0 \ 0 \ 1 \ 0 \ 0 \ 1 \ 0 \ 1 \ 0 \ 0 \ 0 \ 0 \ 1 \ 0 \ 1 \ 1 \ 1 \ 0 \ 0 \ 1 \ 1 \ 0 \ 0 \ 0]$$

Thus, the plaintext bit is “0” in the ciphertext. Because the parity of the first column of B is “0” except its last row and is different from the parity of the first column of U .

Similarly, the last row vector in U is too large (that is $|y|, |y_i| > 2^{x^2}$), so the last terms in the parity vectors is not satisfied the above condition.